

# Legal Aspects of Implementing the Kyoto Protocol Mechanisms: Making Kyoto Work

Edited by  
DAVID FREESTONE  
and  
CHARLOTTE STRECK

*With a foreword by Roberto Dañino and a preface by Ken Newcombe*

## *Contents—Summary*

*List of Contributors* xxviii  
*Table of Treaties and Legislation* xxxv  
*Table of Legislation* xxxvi  
*List of Abbreviations* xxxvii

### I. INTRODUCTION

1. The UN Framework Convention on Climate Change,  
the Kyoto Protocol, and the Kyoto Mechanisms 3  
*David Freestone*

2. Climate Change in Business 25  
*James Cameron*

### II. THE KYOTO FLEXIBLE MECHANISMS: GENERAL ISSUES

3. Legal Ownership and Nature of Kyoto Units and EU Allowances 35  
*Matthieu Wermaere and Charlotte Streck*

4. Accounting for and Taxation of Emission  
Allowances and Credits 54  
*Robert Casamento*

5. Public Participation in CDM and JI Projects 70  
*Nathalie Eddy*

### III. ARTICLE 6 OF THE KYOTO PROTOCOL: JOINT IMPLEMENTATION

6. Joint Implementation: History, Requirements, and Challenges <i>Charlotte Streck</i>	107
7. GHG Emissions Trading Registries <i>Anthony Hobley and Peter Hawkes</i>	128
8. Track One JI and ‘Greening of AAUs’: How could it work? <i>Jari Väyrynen and Franck Lecocq</i>	156
IV. ARTICLE 12 OF THE KYOTO PROTOCOL: CLEAN DEVELOPMENT MECHANISM	
9. CDM Project Cycle and the Role of the UNFCCC Secretariat <i>Maria Netto and Kai-Uwe Barani Schmidt</i>	177
10. Keeping it Clean—Safeguarding the Environmental Integrity of the Clean Development Mechanism <i>Ernestine Meijer and Jacob Werksman</i>	193
11. Meeting Participating Country Responsibilities under the CDM: Designating a National Authority <i>Robert O’ Sullivan and Charles Cormier</i>	214
12. Benefit Sharing under the Clean Development Mechanism <i>Saleemul Huq and Hannah Reid</i>	230
13. Can Companies or Entities from a Non-Party to the Kyoto Protocol Participate in the Flexible Mechanisms? <i>Martijn Wilder</i>	249
V. CARBON SEQUESTRATION	
14. Generation of Sequestration Credits under the CDM <i>Sebastian Scholz and Ian Noble</i>	265
15. Specific Features of Land Use, Land-Use Change, and Forestry Transactions <i>Benoît Bosquet</i>	281
VI. JI AND CDM: CARBON CONTRACTS	
16. Carbon Contracts, Structuring Transactions: Practical Experiences <i>Martijn Wilder, Monique Willis, and Mina Guli</i>	295
17. CERUPT and ERUPT Contracts <i>Daniel van der Weerd</i>	312
18. Negotiating a JI Contract: A Project Developer’s Perspective <i>Anikó Pogány</i>	327
19. Experiences with the Clean Development Mechanism in India <i>Jaya Singhanian</i>	338
20. World Bank Carbon Finance Business: Contracts and	

Emission Reductions Purchase Transactions <i>Charlotte Streck</i>	351
21. Dispute Settlement in ‘Flexible-Mechanism’ Contracts <i>Dane Ratliff</i>	372
VII. ARTICLE 17 OF THE KYOTO PROTOCOL: EMISSION TRADING	
22. Emissions Trading under Article 17 of the Kyoto Protocol <i>Rutger de Witt Wijnen</i>	399
23. The Emissions Trading Scheme of the European Union <i>Robert Dornau</i>	412
24. Implementing the European Emissions Trading Directive in Germany <i>Simon Marr</i>	426
25. UK Emissions Trading Schemes <i>Chris Dodwell</i>	440
26. Pollution Permit Trading in Chile <i>Marcela Main S.</i>	455
27. Emissions Trading Schemes in Australia <i>Josh Carmody and Monique Willis</i>	468
28. Canada’s Experience in Emissions Trading and Participating in the Kyoto Mechanisms <i>Markus Gehring and Bradnee Chambers</i>	485
29. Linking Emissions Trading Schemes: The EU ETS and the ‘Linking Directive’ <i>Jürgen Lefevere</i>	503
VIII. CONCLUSION	
Summary and Outlook <i>David Freestone and Charlotte Streck</i>	529
Appendix 1: Text of the Kyoto Protocol to the UN Framework Convention on Climate Change	539
Appendix 2: Draft Decision -/CP.7 (Mechanisms) of the Conference of the Parties	559

## *List of Contributors*

**Kai-Uwe Barani Schmidt** is a program officer at the UNFCCC Secretariat. He holds a Master’s Degree in macroeconomics and finance from the University of Geneva. After working for an international NGO dedicated to support advanced research and researchers from developing countries he joined the UNFCCC Secretariat in January 1995. He supported negotiations on AIJ and cooperative mechanisms. Presently his main focus is on supporting the work of the CDM Executive Board, inter alia, managing the accreditation

work under the EB and providing support to the registration of CDM project activities.

**Benoît Bosquet** is a Senior Natural Resources Management Specialist in the World Bank Carbon Finance Unit. He coordinates the BioCarbon Fund, which started operations in May 2004, and manages four energy and forestry projects for the Prototype Carbon Fund in Bulgaria, Moldova, and Romania. He holds degrees in applied linguistics and business administration from Belgium, an MA in International Relations from the Johns Hopkins University School of Advanced International Studies, and a PhD in Policy Studies from the University of Maryland.

**James Cameron** is a practicing barrister and of counsel to the law firm of Baker & McKenzie where he heads the Global Climate Change, Clean Energy, and Emissions Trading Practice group. He was a founding director of FIELD—the Foundation for International Environmental Law and Development and taught at the Universities of Cambridge and London. He advises leading companies as well as governments and the European Commission on Climate Change issues.

**Josh Carmody** is a senior associate and senior member of the Baker & McKenzie' Global Clean Energy & Climate Change team in Melbourne, Australia. He advises a number of multilateral and private carbon funds, project sponsors and financiers, governments, and other participants in international carbon and renewable energy markets.

**Robert Casamento** is a senior manager in Deloitte's UK Energy Markets Team and is a qualified chartered accountant and trained as an ISO 14001 environmental management system auditor. He specializes in the risk management and financial consequences of emerging environmental regulations and sustainable development issues and has published numerous discussion papers and articles on emissions trading, risk management, and assurance issues. He is currently Project Director of the World Economic Forum's Global GHG Register Initiative and in 2003 authored a report for the European Commission assessing the capacity of Central and Eastern European countries to host and maintain Joint Implementation projects.

**Bradnee Chambers** is a senior legal research fellow at the Centre for International Sustainable Development Law in Canada and is also Senior Programme Coordinator of the United Nations University's Institute for Advanced Studies (UNU/IAS) in Tokyo, and Coordinator of their Multilateralism and Sustainable Development Programme. He previously worked at the UNCTAD Transnational Corporation Division on National Legislation and the Regulations Relating to Transnational Corporations. He has published widely in these fields and regularly participates in the meetings of the Conference of the Parties and Subsidiary Bodies of the UNFCCC and CBD, as well as WTO Ministerials, and CSD. He is a convening lead author in the Millennium Ecosystem Assessment.

**Charles Cormier** is a Senior Environment Specialist in the Environmental and Socially Sustainable Development division of the World Bank Institute, Washington, D.C, where his task is to promote capacity building on climate change issues in developing countries. Prior to joining the Bank, he worked for Environment Canada and was involved in international negotiations of multilateral environmental agreements, including the Basel Convention and the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change. Mr Cormier has had first hand experience in drafting and implementing regulations to ensure that Canada meets its international obligations.

**Chris Dodwell** heads the multi-disciplinary team responsible for the UK implementation of the EU Emissions Trading Scheme, including the preparation of the UK National Allocation Plan in the Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs. He has advised on a number of UK government initiatives including the UK Emissions Trading Scheme, the Climate Change Levy Agreements and, most recently, the promotion of combined heat and power. He has been a member of the UK team negotiating the EU Emissions Trading Directive since its proposal in October 2001. He qualified as a solicitor with Freshfields Bruckhaus Deringer, and has an LLM in Environmental Law from University College, London.

**Robert Dornau** was the Conference Director of the 2004 Carbon Expo, the first trade fair for the carbon market, working as a consultant with the World Bank and the International Emissions Trading Association (IETA). From 2001–4 he was manager of IETA responsible for coordinating working groups on ‘Contracts’, ‘CDM’ and ‘GHG Registries’, and the development of the IETA Emission Trading Master Agreement. From 2001–4 he was an official observer of the Executive Board (EB) of the Kyoto Protocol CDM. Before joining IETA he was project manager for Deutsche Boerse Group and a research fellow at the Center for European Economic Research. Robert holds a Master’s Degree in Economics from the University of Konstanz, Germany.

**Nathalie Eddy** has been working on climate change issues since 1998, with the UN Climate Change Secretariat in Bonn, Germany (pre-Kyoto), the Center for International Environmental Law (CIEL), US Climate Action Network (USCAN), and Greenpeace. During her last three years with USCAN and Greenpeace, Nathalie focused her climate work on the public participation provisions of the Clean Development Mechanism of the Kyoto Protocol. She authored and presented several briefing papers on public participation in CDM at the international climate change negotiations and supported the creation of the International Forum of Indigenous Peoples and Local Communities on Climate Change.

**David Freestone** is Deputy General Counsel, Legal Advisory Services at the World Bank, Washington, D.C. Prior to moving to the World Bank, he was Professor of International Law at the University of Hull, England. Professor Freestone has published widely in the field of international environmental law, is on the Board of Editors of British Yearbook of International Law (ByIL) and Yearbook of International Environmental Law (YbIEL) (OUP) and is founder and Editor-in-Chief of the International Journal of Marine and Coastal Law. His recent books include International Law and Sustainable Development (edited with Alan Boyle, 1999, OUP) and Legislating for Sustainable Fisheries (with William Edeson and Elly Gudmundsdottir, 2001, World Bank).

**Markus Gehring** is Lead Counsel at the Centre for International Sustainable Development Law. He is also a PhD candidate conducting legal research on a WTO/GATT law project at the Institute for International Affairs, University of Hamburg, Germany. His research involves methods of implementing the precautionary principle in WTO law. He also teaches German constitutional and administrative law in Hamburg. He has worked for the Ministry of Environment of Hamburg and has participated in various environment and international law conferences, including the recent COP6 of the Framework Convention on Climate Change in The Hague, Netherlands.

**Mina Guli** is currently Counsel with the Project Finance and Co-Financing Group of the World Bank’s Legal Department, which provides legal advice and services to the Bank Carbon Finance Unit. She is on a staff exchange from Baker & McKenzie’s Global Climate Change Practice Group. Prior to joining Baker & McKenzie, she worked with the Sydney Futures Exchange in the development of contracts for trade in carbon sequestration. Mina has a Bachelor’s Degree of Science and Law from Monash University, and a Master’s in Law from the University of Melbourne.

**Peter Hawkes** is a member of Baker & McKenzie’s Global Clean Energy and Climate Change Practice Group, and Environmental Law Group in London, UK. He specializes in climate change issues, including renewable energy and emissions trading projects, and issues relating to environmental and health and safety law, in particular in contaminated land, waste and water issues, and matters relating to the energy industry. He is actively involved in the International Emissions Trading Association, UK Emissions Trading Group, and the UK Environmental Law Association’s Climate Change Working Group.

**Anthony Hoble** is a senior associate with Baker & McKenzie’s Global Climate Change and Clean Energy Practice Group in London, UK. Anthony has a first class Honours Degree in Chemistry with Physics and recently completed a Masters Degree in environmental law. He is an expert in environmental law and climate change/clean energy law. His clients include the EU Commission, World Bank, BP, DuPont, and BHP Billiton. Anthony has lectured and written widely on all subjects of environmental law, particularly in relation to contaminated land, renewable energy and emissions trading under the Kyoto Protocol.

**Saleemul Huq** is Director of the Climate Change Programme at the International Institute for Environment and Development in London and was previously an Academic Visitor at the Huxley School of Environment at Imperial College, London from where he holds a PhD in Plant Physiology. Dr Huq founded the Bangladesh Centre for Advanced Studies and was awarded the Robert McNamara Fellowship from the World Bank (1986–7) and Duggan Fellowship (1989) from the Natural Resources Defence Fund, US. He is an Adviser to UNDP Capacity 21 Programme where he has helped develop the Agenda 21 Programmes in Mongolia, Bhutan, Gambia, and Kazakhstan.

**Franck Lecocq** is an economist with the Development Economics Research Group of the World Bank. He has worked on many aspects of the economics of global environmental problems, including selection of mitigation paths, choice of instrument under uncertainty, post-Kyoto mitigation regimes, and project-based mechanisms. He also advises the World Bank Carbon Finance Business operations, in particular with regard to the state and trends of the carbon market. Mr Lecocq graduated from Ecole Polytechnique (France) and holds a PhD in economics from Ecole Nationale du Genie Rural, des Eaux et des Forets, France (France).

**Jürgen Lefevere** is administrator at the Climate Change and Energy Unit of the European Commission Environment Directorate General where he works on the EU emission allowance-trading scheme. Previously as Director of the FIELD Climate Change and Energy Programme he was involved in preparatory work for the Emissions Trading Green Paper as well as the Emission Trading Directive and the GHG monitoring and reporting guidelines. He has acted as legal advisor to the Alliance of Small Island States (AOSIS) and as representative of Samoa in the UNFCCC. He is currently a guest lecturer at the University of Leuven and University College London.

**Marcela Mains** has worked with the Chilean Comisión Nacional del Medio Ambiente (CONAMA), which is in charge of Energy and Climate issues, since 1998. She is responsible for climate change within the Department of International Affairs within CONAMA, and is currently drafting the Tradable Emissions Permit Framework Law for Chile.

**Simon Marr** is currently seconded to the German Ministry for Environment where he is working on the implementation of an emissions trading system in Germany. Dr Marr is a Senior Fellow at Ecologic—Institute for International and European Environmental Policy in Berlin, Germany where he provides legal advice on aspects of climate change, as well as other fields of environmental protection.

**Ernestine Meijer** is a senior researcher at the Center on Environmental and Land Use Law of New York University School of Law. She studied international law in Amsterdam (the Netherlands) and Grenoble (France) and has also acted as counsel to a number of environmental NGOs in several cases on issues of national, European, and international environmental law. She was a member of the Taskforce on Traditional Knowledge and Access and Benefit Sharing of the United Nations Development Programme and has worked at the Foundation for International and Environmental Law and Development, and at the Dutch Ministry of Environment.

**Maria Netto** is a program officer at the UNFCCC Secretariat. She holds a Master's degree in international relations with focus on development and economics from the institute of international studies in Geneva. After working with a UNDP project in Central America and in an international organization for south-south cooperation she joined the UNFCCC Secretariat in February 1997. She supported negotiations on the financial mechanism of the Climate Change Convention, national communications from non-Annex I Parties, and cooperative mechanisms. Presently her main focus is on supporting the work of the CDM Executive Board, inter alia, supporting the methodological work and registration of CDM project activities.

**Ian Noble** is an advisor to the Carbon Finance Unit of the Environment Department at the World Bank, Washington, D.C. He was previously Professor of Global Climate Change Research in the Institute of Advanced Studies at the Australian National University and

Chief Executive Officer of the Cooperative Research Centre for Greenhouse Accounting at the Research School of Biological Sciences, Australian National University. He was also co-chair of the Working Group on the Millennium Assessment of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change.

**Robert O'Sullivan** is a Junior Professional Associate in the Cofinancing and Project Finance Practice Group in the World Bank's Legal Department, which provides legal advice and services to the Carbon Finance Unit of the Bank. Prior to joining the Bank he worked for the Environmental Defenders Office, and Minter Ellison Lawyers in Brisbane, Australia. He holds a LLM in international law, and undergraduate degrees in law, biology, and philosophy.

**Anikó Pogány** is a senior advisor at the Hungarian Ministry of Environment, where she advises on the implementation of the EU Emission Trading Scheme in Hungary. Prior to joining the Ministry, she was the Director of Strategy at Pannonpower in Pecs, Hungary, where she managed and concluded the sale of JI credits for the Pecs biomass project to the Prototype Carbon Fund. Between 1996 and 2000 she worked for Ernst & Young Budapest office in the area of corporate finance. As a senior consultant and later manager, she was expert in financial modelling, business plan preparation and review, valuation and due diligence. She is also a member of the Hungarian Association of Environmental Education.

**Dane Ratliff** is Assistant Legal Counsel at the Permanent Court of Arbitration at The Hague, and was educated in political science, philosophy, and law. He has represented the Permanent Court of Arbitration at COPs of the UNFCCC, Convention on Biological Diversity, and other meetings of environmental conventions. Mr Ratliff is also a lecturer in environmental and human rights law at the Universities of Wurzburg and Rotterdam.

**Hannah Reid** is a research associate working primarily with the Climate Change Programme at the International Institute for Environment and Development. Dr Reid has a broad background of working on development, community-based biodiversity management, and climate change related issues.

**Sebastian M Scholz** is a PhD research fellow at the Center for Development Research in Bonn, Germany. His doctoral thesis examines forestry projects in the CDM as a means of carbon mitigation and poverty alleviation. Previously he worked for the Berlin-based Institute for Applied Ecology on synergies between the UN Framework Convention on Climate Change and the Convention on Biological Diversity. He gained international work experience in forests and climate change as a research fellow at the Food and Agriculture Organization (FAO) in Rome, Italy and with the World Bank BioCarbon Fund team.

**Jaya Singhania** is a senior counsel with the Infrastructure Development Finance Company Limited (IDFC), Mumbai, India. She advises the IDFC on issues pertaining to corporate and project finance law as well as on CDM carbon contracts. Her professional experience includes project finance and project development work in India. She holds a Master's Degree in international law.

At the time of editing the volume, **Charlotte Streck** was Senior Counsel in the Cofinancing and Project Finance Practice Group in the World Bank's Legal Department, which provides legal advice and services to the Carbon Finance Unit of the Bank. Dr Streck was educated in both law and biology, and is an adjunct lecturer in environmental law at the University of Potsdam, Germany. Before joining the World Bank in 2000 Dr Streck was a participant in the 'Global Public Policy Networks Project', which provided strategic advice for the Secretary General of the UN. She has authored and co-authored four books and published several articles on environmental law and policy, and she is a board member of the Global Public Policy Institute. Since February 2005 Dr Streck is Director at Climate Focus.

**Jari Väyrynen** is an environmental specialist and project manager in the World Bank Carbon Finance Business, managing CDM and JI projects in various countries, including Brazil, Honduras, the Czech Republic, and Poland. He is also managing activities under the PCFplus capacity building, research and training programme. Before joining the World Bank he worked for the Finnish Ministry of the Environment and the European Commission.

At the time of contributing, **Daniel van der Weerd** was legal counsel at the Senter agency of the Netherlands Ministry of Economic Affairs since February 2001. At Senter he works as counsel for Carboncredits.nl, which includes the ERUPT and CERUPT programmes. He is counsel for several bilateral cooperation programmes and for the export credits programmes and is also involved in developing new Joint Implementation Facilities for the Ministry of Economic Affairs of the Netherlands. Since December 2004, Mr. van der Weerd is manager of the ERUPT and CERUPT programmes.

**Jake Werksman** is Senior Advisor to the Global Inclusion Program of the Rockefeller Foundation. Previously, he was Environmental Institutions and Governance Adviser, United Nations Development Programme, and held various posts at the Foundation for International Environmental Law and Development including Managing Director. He is currently an adjunct professor of law at New York University, and was a lecturer in international economic law at the University of London. He has held visiting academic posts at the United Nations University and the Universities of Edinburgh, Kent, and Connecticut Law School.

**Matthieu Wermaere** is an associate attorney at Huglo Lepage in Brussels. He advises European clients including government departments on all aspects of environment law. Between 1999 and 2003 he has worked with the European Commission's Climate Change Group.

**Martijn Wilder** is a partner at Baker & McKenzie where he is responsible for the global climate change and emissions trading practice and advises governments, major corporations, and multi-lateral organizations including the World Bank Carbon Finance Unit, the European Commission, UNEP, and leading financial institutions. Mr Wilder has published widely on environmental and international law, is an adjunct lecturer at the University of NSW, on the NSW Greenhouse Office Advisory Panel, and is the President of TRAFFIC (Oceania). He is on the Board of the Australian Branch of the International Law Association and is its representative on the ILA Committee on the Trans-National Enforcement of Environmental Law.

**Monique Willis** is an associate and senior member of the Baker & McKenzie's Global Clean Energy & Climate Change team in Sydney, Australia. She is an advisor to the World Bank's Carbon Finance Unit and other investment institutions participating in the international carbon and renewable energy markets. She advises governments around the world on emissions trading and climate change policy and regulatory issues.

**Rutger de Witt Wijnen** is a partner at De Brauw Blackstone Westbroek, Amsterdam, where he developed their international emissions trading practice, advising on all aspects of emissions trading and carbon credit creation projects, including issues relating to the EU Emissions Trading Directive and the Kyoto Protocol. He has drafted and negotiated Emission Reductions Purchase Agreements for CDM and JI projects in Latin America, Asia, and Eastern Europe. He has advised the Dutch Government, acting through the Ministries of the Environment and Economic Affairs, on the Emission Reduction Purchase Facilities with various international financial institutions, such as the IBRD, IFC, CAF, EBRD, and Rabobank International.